MACQUARIE UNIVERSITY

HIGHER DEGREE THESIS (PhD)

AUTHOR'S CONSENT

This is to certify that I, Geoff Williams, being a candidate for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy am aware of the policy of the University relating to the retention and use of higher degree theses as contained in the University's PhD Regulations generally, and in particular, Regulation 21(2).

In the light of this policy and the provisions of the above Regulations, I agree to allow a copy of my thesis to be deposited in the University Library for consultation, loan and photocopying forthwith.

Signature of Witness

Signature of Candidate

Dated this ... day of September, 1994

The Academic Senate on 13 June 1995 resolved that the candidate had satisfied requirements for admission to this degree. This thesis represents a major part of the prescribed program of study.
Joint book-reading and literacy pedagogy: 
A socio-semantic examination

Volume 1

Geoff Williams

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
Doctor of Philosophy

School of English and Linguistics
Macquarie University
1994
In memory

Molly Williams

1907 - 1991
# Table of Contents

## Volume One

### Certificate of Original Submission

Page i

### Abstract

Page ii

### Acknowledgements

Page iv

### Chapter One

#### Introduction

1.1 The study

Page 1

1.2 Joint book-reading and the notion of partnership in children's literacy development

Page 2

1.3 Some general priorities for research in joint book-reading

Page 6

1.4 Overview

Page 10

### Chapter Two

#### Research in Joint Book-reading and the Discourse of Literacy Pedagogy

2.1 Introduction

Page 13

2.2 Early research interest in joint book-reading practices

Page 14

2.3 Emergent literacy

Page 19

2.4 Studies of interactive language in joint book-reading and literacy learning

Page 23

2.5 An excursus: Vygotskian theory

Page 31

2.6 Some key difficulties with Vygotsky's theory

Page 41

2.7 Variation in joint book-reading interaction

Page 46

2.7.1 Teale's analysis of relations between home background and young children's literacy development

Page 47

2.7.2 Tizard and Hughes' study of everyday talk in the home between mothers and daughters

Page 48

2.7.3 Wells' Bristol study

Page 50

2.7.4 Heath's study of language use in three communities

Page 53

2.8 Uses of joint book-reading research in the discourse of literacy pedagogy

Page 60

2.9 Summary

Page 67

### Chapter Three

#### The Study

##### Part A Research Questions, Preliminary Analysis and Participant Selection

3.1 Introduction

Page 68

3.2 Research priorities deriving from previous work in the field

Page 69
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Volume One

Chapter Three (cont.)

3.3 Difficulties with the use of measures of socioeconomic status in the research field 73
3.4 The problem of selecting participants from contrasting sets of social class relations 75
3.5 Excursus: Theoretical resources for modelling social class relations 76
3.5.1 Classification and framing 76
3.5.2 Classification and framing and the social division of labour 78
3.5.3 An expanded description: the concept field 79
3.6 Criteria for selection of participants 81
3.7 A preliminary survey of aspects of family joint book-reading practices 84
3.7.1 Development of the questionnaire 86
3.7.2 Distribution of the questionnaire and rate of return 87
3.7.3 Some results from the preliminary survey 87
3.7.3.1 Distribution of questionnaire by sex of child 88
3.7.3.2 Patterns of joint book-reading 88
3.7.3.3 Paid employment of mothers 89
3.7.3.4 Volunteers for recording for the main study 90
3.7.3.5 Sources of texts for joint book-reading 90
3.7.3.6 Types of text most frequently read 91
3.7.3.7 Reasons for reading to children 92
3.7.3.8 Children's main interests at home 92
3.7.4 Selection of participants from volunteers 94
3.8 Occupation and educational backgrounds of the parents 96
3.9 Summary 99

Part B Data Gathering and Preparation

3.10 Procedures used to obtain samples of mother-child interaction during joint book-reading 101
3.11 Selection of object texts by mothers and children 104
3.12 Audiorecording teacher-student interaction in Kindergarten classes 107
3.13 Data sampling and preparation 110
3.14 Summary 110
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Volume One

### Chapter Four

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Identifying a theoretical framework for linguistic analysis of semiotic mediation</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Preliminary: Rommetveit's problematic analysis of semiotic mediation</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Preliminary: speech genre and the analysis of semiotic mediation</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Systemic functional linguistics and the analysis of semiotic mediation</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>The concept of realization in systemic linguistic theory</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Notions of context in systemic functional linguistics</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.1</td>
<td>The contextual variables: field, tenor and mode</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.2</td>
<td>Context, text and language as system</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.3</td>
<td>An expansion of the description of cotextual variables</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Modelling options at the semantic stratum: semantic networks</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.1</td>
<td>Halliday's semantic network for contexts of maternal control</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.2</td>
<td>Towards a context-independent semantic network: Hasan's message semantics</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.2.1</td>
<td>The semantic unit, message</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.2.2</td>
<td>An illustration of a fragment of a semantic network in Hasan's message semantics</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Conventions for transcription and message representation</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Some additional conventions for message analysis</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Description of the extent of object text reading</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter Five

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Prefacing elements of messages</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Some choices for textual and logical meanings</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Supplementing messages</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1</td>
<td>Logico-semantic relations between messages</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2</td>
<td>Overt and covert relations between messages</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.3</td>
<td>Supplementation to speech functions</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Volume One

### Chapter Five (cont.)

- **5.5** Some choices in experiential meanings 201
- **5.5.1** Systems dependent on [doing] 202
- **5.5.2** Systems dependent on [being] 208
- **5.6** Extension of the description of the function of demands for information 213
- **5.7** Punctuative messages 217
- **5.8** Summary 222

### Chapter Six

- **Reading The Three Little Pigs at Home**
  - **6.1** Introduction 223
  - **6.2** The children and their families 224
  - **6.3** Some commonalities in the occasions of reading *The three little pigs* 230
  - **6.4** Reading difference in family readings of *The three little pigs* 233
  - **6.5** Joint book-reading as situation-type 242
  - **6.6** Summary 249

### Chapter Seven

- **Results of the Message Semantic Analysis of the Interactive Text**
  - **7.1** Introduction 251
  - **7.2** Statistical description of the results of the linguistic analysis 251
  - **7.3** The extent of object text reading in the two social groups 253
  - **7.4** Interaction during joint book-reading between mothers and children 256
  - **7.5** Initiating interaction: children 259
  - **7.6** Demands for information 261
    - **7.6.1** Mothers demands for information 261
    - **7.6.2** Selection of [demand;information;follow; maintain topic:develop] 265
    - **7.6.3** Children’s demands for information 267
  - **7.7** Prefacing of messages 270
    - **7.7.1** The linguistic construction of subjective states of consciousness 271
    - **7.7.2** Prefacing messages through some experiential and interpersonal resources 272
  - **7.8** Supplementation of messages 275
  - **7.9** Experiential meanings 277
    - **7.9.1** Some differences in the selection of experiential meanings within the two social groups 278
    - **7.9.2** Selection of experiential meanings by the two categories of speakers in the two social groups 281
  - **7.9.3** References to mothers 282
  - **7.9.4** References to qualities of characters 282
  - **7.9.5** References to metalanguage 285
  - **7.10** Intra-group variation 287
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volume One</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Seven (cont.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Eight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coding orientation and social class relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coding orientation and schooling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coding orientation and variable semantic variants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coding orientation and variable interaction in joint book-reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other sociolinguistic evidence of semantic variation as a function of coding orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rereading Roadville reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Nine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Book-reading in the Discourse of Literacy Pedagogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The pedagogic significance of joint book-reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedagogic discourse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A model of pedagogic relations for joint book-reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Ten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical points of departure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretations of variation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A review of methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some implications for the discourse of literacy pedagogy in the Kindergarten year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

2.1 Components involved in planning story lessons (Green and Harker, 1982:199) 65

2.2 Components in story reading: interactive view (Green and Harker, 1982:200) 66

3.1 Lower Autonomy Professional Social Group: Occupations of Parents 97

3.2 Higher Autonomy Professional Group: Occupations of Parents 97

3.3 Lower Autonomy Professional Group: Educational Background of Parents 98

3.4 Higher Autonomy Professional Group: Educational Background of Parents 98

3.5 Titles of object texts read by mothers LAP Social Group 105

3.6 Titles of object texts read by mothers HAP Social Group 106

3.7 Titles of object texts read by teachers LAP Social Group Schools 109

3.8 Titles of object texts read to by teachers HAP Social Group Schools 109

4.1 Network representation of Nigel's protolinguistic meaning potential in the period 1 year: 1 year, 1.5 months 124

4.2 Matthiessen's model of dimensions of the semiotic space of registers 135

4.3 Lexicogrammatical network fragment of mood to illustrate the concept of delicacy of options 136

4.4 Halliday's semantic network for maternal control situation-type (1973b:89) 151

4.5 Realization statements for Halliday's semantic network for maternal control situation-type 152

4.6 Selected examples of the relationship between clause and message boundaries in Hasan's message semantics 157

4.7 Hasan's network of choices in making demands for information 158

4.8 Hasan's realization statements for options in asking questions 159
List of Figures (cont.)

4.9 Analysis of demands for information using Hasan's description 162

5.1 Some choices for prefacing messages concerning the construction of 'point of view' 177

5.2 Some choices for messages which select [prefaced] 183

5.3 Some choices available for textual and logical meanings 187

5.4 Some further options for messages which select [supplementing] 197

5.5 Some choices in an experiential network of systems dependent on the feature [doing] 203

5.6 Some choices in systems dependent on the feature [being] 209

5.7 Some choices in a network of experiential meanings 213

5.8 Some further choices for demands for information 216

5.9 Some choices for punctuative messages 218

6.1 Frequency of categories of items occurring as the options [effecting] or [element] in the discussions of *The three little pigs* 244

7.1 Frequencies of [initiate]: individual children 260

7.2 Median frequency of mothers' and teachers' selection of some types of questions 264

7.3 Median frequencies of selection of [develop] by individual dyads in the two social groups 266

7.4 Frequencies of [confirm] in children's questions 268

7.5 Frequencies of [apprize] in children's questions 269

7.6 Mothers' references to characters as the referential signification of [element] simultaneously with selection of [being:describing:state] 283

7.7 Children's references to characters as the referential signification of [element] simultaneously with selection of [being:describing:state] 284

9.1 A model of relations of pedagogic discourse (from Bernstein, 1990:197) 327
List of Figures (cont.)

9.2 A model of pedagogic relations for joint book-reading 333

List of Tables

Tables 3.1 - 3.23 are presented in Volume 2, Appendix 2.

5.1 Categorization of referential significations of the options [effecting] or [effector] 207

5.2 Categorization of referential signification of [purview] 208

6.1 Distribution of punctuative and progressive messages in readings of The three little pigs 233

6.2 Distribution of numbers of messages contributed to interaction by mothers and children 234

6.3 Distribution of selection of options in demanding information 237

7.1 Total number of object text messages read by mother-child dyads in four joint book-reading sessions 254

7.2 Total number of object text messages read within each school class 255

7.3 Total mother-child interactive messages 256

7.4 Median frequencies of mother-child interactive messages 256

7.5 Total school class interactive messages 258

7.6 Median frequencies of school class interactive messages 259

7.7 Median frequencies of selection of some types of demands for information in the two social groups 262

List of Tables (cont.)

7.9 Median frequencies for the selection of [prefaced:experiential:idea:knowledge; demand;information] and the options [confirm] and [apprize] by mothers

7.10 Selection by both speakers of some features of experiential meanings simultaneously with the child as the referential signification of the option [effecting] within the two social groups

7.11 Selection of some features of experiential meanings simultaneously with the child as the referential signification of the option [element] within the two social groups by both speakers

7.12 Mothers' selection of some features of experiential meanings with the child as the referential signification of the option [element] within the two social groups
Certificate of Original Submission

I certify that this work has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other university or institution.

[Signature]

Geoff Williams
Abstract

The study contributes to the fields of educational linguistics and semantic variation by examining linguistic interaction during joint book-reading between mothers and four-year-old children, and between teachers and Kindergarten classes at the beginning of school.

Joint book-reading was selected because of its centrality to the metaphor of a partnership between home and school in children's literacy development. The problem for the study was to investigate possible systematic semantic variation in linguistic interaction associated with social class locations of speakers, and relations between any such variants and features of interaction in joint book-reading in Kindergarten.

A preliminary survey of 427 families in two socio-geographically contrasted sites established that joint book-reading was a common social practice, and gave sufficient indications of variation to justify an intensive socio-semantic study. Two sets of ten mother-child dyads, contrasted for class locations using Bernstein's (1990) theory of class relations, were constructed and recordings of joint book-reading sessions made by mothers. Recordings of interaction in two sets of ten Kindergarten classes in the same socio-geographical areas were made by teachers.

Vygotsky's theory of semiotic mediation was the general resource used for interpreting children's learning, but it was necessary to resolve problems in the theory in the modelling of contexts for learning, and of mediational means. For this purpose the systemic functional linguistic concept of context of situation, as proposed by Halliday (1978) and expanded by Hasan (in press (a)), was deployed.

Transcripts of recordings were analysed through a semantic network developed for the study, based on a network proposed by Hasan (1983).
Semantic variation associated with class locations of families was found across all four metafunctions described within systemic theory, and one variant found to be associated with Kindergarten classroom interaction. The variable semantic features were interpreted as the realization of different principles regulating the individuation of experience, using Bernstein's theories of coding orientation and pedagogic discourse.
Acknowledgements

My primary intellectual and personal debt is to Emeritus Professor Ruqaiya Hasan. I thank her for both her rigorous demands and constant support.

The participating mothers, teachers and children were extraordinarily generous with their time, and in giving me access to their conversations about texts.

Dr Carmel Cloran provided invaluable advice about semantic network analysis, and Dr Alan Taylor support with the statistical analyses.

Many friends and colleagues offered practical assistance. I thank especially Robyn Cusworth, Alison Lockart and Len Unsworth.

Carolyn MacLulich provided the unfailing patience, encouragement and levelling good humour which made the writing of this thesis possible.