ISSUES OF INTERDISCURSIVITY IN THE COMMERCIALISATION OF PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE: THE CASE OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO THE DIVISION OF LINGUISTICS AND PSYCHOLOGY IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

BY

JONATHAN ALEXANDER CRICHTON BA (HONS), DIP TESOL, MA (APP LING)

SYDNEY, NEW SOUTH WALES
JUNE, 2003
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figures and tables</td>
<td>IX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>XII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>XIII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of abbreviations</td>
<td>XIV</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 1: Introduction**

1.1 The context of the study                    | 1     |
1.11 The commercialisation of education         | 1     |
1.12 The effects on teachers' practices         | 5     |
1.2 The focus of the study                      | 6     |
1.21 The setting                               | 6     |
1.22 The question of tension                    | 9     |
1.3 Overview of chapters                        | 10    |

**Chapter 2: Requirements for the theoretical framework**

2.1 Introduction                                | 15    |
2.2 The need for a discourse analytical framework| 16    |
2.3 Cicourel's challenge                        | 19    |
2.4 The implications of Cicourel's challenge     | 23    |
2.41 Ontological differences: language, context and social theory | 23    |
2.411 Language and context                      | 23    |
2.412 The macro-micro problem in discourse analysis | 26    |
2.413 The macro-micro problem in critical discourse analysis | 30    |
2.42 Implications for the ontology              | 35    |
2.43 Methodological needs: the interdependence of ontology and methodology | 36    |
2.5 Requirements for the theoretical framework  | 41    |

**Chapter 3: The theoretical framework**

3.1 Introduction                                | 42    |
3.2 Fairclough's framework for critical discourse analysis | 42    |
3.21 Discursive practices, interdiscursivity and the archive | 43    |
3.22 Fairclough's methodological recommendations | 48    |
3.3 Requirements for the theoretical framework  | 50    |
3.4 Layder's guidelines for social research     | 51    |
3.41 The macro-micro problem                    | 52    |
3.42 The research map                           | 53    |
3.43 Drawing on the research map                 | 55    |
3.5 Outline of the theoretical framework        | 57    |
3.51 The ontology                              | 57    |
3.511 'Exclusions' from the ontology            | 60    |
3.52 Operationalising the perspectives          | 62    |
3.521 The social resource perspective           | 64    |
3.5211 Systemic functional linguistics          | 65    |
3.5212 Conversational analysis                  | 67    |
3.5213 Capturing emergent dynamism              | 69    |
3.522 The participants' perspective            | 70    |
3.523 The social practice perspective ........................................... 71
3.5231 Symbolic interactionism and ethnomethodology .................. 73
3.524 The social/institutional perspective .................................... 77
3.5241 Social theory and contemporary society ......................... 80
3.5242 Key themes in contemporary society ................................. 82
3.52421 Giddens ......................................................... 84
3.52422 Bourdieu ....................................................... 87
3.52423 Foucault ........................................................ 94
3.52424 Habermas ....................................................... 97
3.5243 Implications for operationalising the social/institutional perspective ......................................................... 102
3.53 The process of analysis ..................................................... 103
3.531 The interactive model of data analysis ............................... 103
3.532 Data coding ......................................................... 107
3.533 Evaluation .......................................................... 113
3.5331 External reliability/objectivity/confirrmability ................. 115
3.5332 Internal reliability/dependability/auditability .................. 115
3.5333 Internal validity/credibility/authenticity ....................... 115
3.5334 External validity/transferability/fittingness .................... 116
3.5335 Utilisation/application/action orientation ...................... 116
3.6 Summary of the theoretical framework ................................ 117

Chapter 4: Description of the study .......................................... 118
4.1 Introduction .......................................................................... 118
4.2 Design of the study ........................................................... 118
4.21 Rationale .......................................................................... 118
4.211 The brochures and social practice ................................. 119
4.212 Predicting the colonisation of teachers' practices .............. 119
4.22 Data reduction .............................................................. 122
4.221 Data selection: the data sets ....................................... 122
4.2211 The participants' perspective ..................................... 125
4.2212 The social resource perspective ................................. 125
4.2213 Combining the participants' and social resource perspectives ........................................................................ 126
4.2214 The social/institutional perspective ......................... 127
4.222 Data analysis ............................................................ 129
4.2221 Coding .................................................................. 129
4.2222 Data management .................................................. 130
4.23 Data display .................................................................. 131
4.24 Data sampling, negotiating access and collection .............. 132
4.241 The brochures ............................................................ 133
4.242 The teachers and critical incident diaries ....................... 135
4.2421 The teachers .......................................................... 136
4.2422 The diaries ............................................................. 139
4.243 The EA News ............................................................ 140
4.244 NEAS documentation ............................................. 141
4.244 CELTA materials ...................................................... 141
4.3 Summary of the study ..................................................... 142

Chapter 5: The analyst's perspective ......................................... 143
5.1 Introduction ......................................................................... 143
5.2 Operationalising the analyst's perspective ......................... 144
5.21 The analyst's perspective as topic and resource ............... 144
7.431 Students and readers as beneficiaries ........................................ 305
7.4311 Aspirations, needs and skills .................................................. 305
7.4312 Possession and product selection ........................................... 306
7.432 Consumption processes .......................................................... 309
7.4321 Producing consumption ......................................................... 310
7.4322 Providing consumption ......................................................... 312
7.4323 Automating consumption ....................................................... 313
7.433 Interdiscursive relations ......................................................... 315
7.5 Summary of the social resource perspective ................................. 316

Chapter 8: The social/institutional perspective .................................... 317
8.1 Introduction ................................................................................. 317
8.2 The analysis and contemporary society ........................................ 317
8.21 Globalisation, neoliberalism and consumer culture ....................... 318
8.211 Intersections and concerns ....................................................... 318
8.212 Bourdieu’s critique .................................................................. 321
8.213 Explaining meso and micro relations ........................................ 327
8.2131 Teachers .............................................................................. 327
8.2132 Students .............................................................................. 328
8.2133 Managers ............................................................................ 330
8.2134 Meso and micro relations as class struggle ............................... 332
8.3 The influence of macro actors ...................................................... 333
8.31 The data sets ............................................................................ 333
8.311 EA News .............................................................................. 333
8.312 NEAS regulations ................................................................... 334
8.313 CELTA training materials ....................................................... 336
8.32 Analysis: from discovery to search ............................................. 336
8.4 The findings: the economic and the social ................................... 337
8.41 EA News ................................................................................ 337
8.411 The premise of subordination .................................................. 338
8.412 Taiwan and the race debate ...................................................... 340
8.4121 Social division and market decline ......................................... 340
8.4122 Social division as economic intervention ............................... 342
8.413 Summary .............................................................................. 345
8.42 NEAS .................................................................................... 345
8.421 The regulation and reproduction of interests ............................. 345
8.4211 The interests of NEAS, the EA and ELICOS managers .......... 346
8.4212 NEAS and the interests of government .................................. 347
8.422 The federal construction of ‘consumer protection’ ..................... 349
8.423 The NEAS construction of ‘quality’ ......................................... 351
8.4231 Teaching ‘quality’ and the perceptions of participants ............. 351
8.4232 Exclusions from the construction of the workplace ............... 353
8.424 Summary .............................................................................. 356
8.43 CELTA .................................................................................. 357
8.431 The CELTA sector as a macro actor ....................................... 357
8.432 The global construction of ‘good teaching’ ............................... 360
8.433 ‘Good teaching’ as the legitimate competence ......................... 364
8.434 Summary .............................................................................. 367
8.5 Summary of the social/institutional perspective ............................ 368
Chapter 9: Conclusions, evaluation and implications ................................. 370
  9.1 Introduction ...................................................................................... 370
  9.2 Conclusions ................................................................................... 370
    9.21 The analyst's perspective ............................................................ 371
    9.22 The participants' perspective ....................................................... 372
    9.23 The social resource perspective ................................................... 373
    9.24 The social/institutional perspective ............................................. 375
  9.3 Evaluation, quality control and implications ..................................... 376
    9.31 Evaluation and reflexivity .......................................................... 377
    9.32 Quality control ........................................................................... 379
      9.321 External reliability/objectivity/confirmability ............................ 379
        9.3211 The audit trail .................................................................... 380
        9.3212 External reliability ............................................................. 382
      9.322 Internal reliability/dependability/auditability .............................. 383
        9.3221 The relationship between the analyst and the study ............... 383
        9.3222 Coherence of theoretical and analytical constructs ................. 384
        9.3223 Clarity of the research question ........................................... 385
        9.3224 The relationship between design, data and investigation ...... 385
        9.3225 Consistency of coding and procedures ................................ 386
      9.323 Internal validity/credibility/authenticity ..................................... 386
        9.3231 The rendition of context ....................................................... 387
        9.3232 The warrant for findings ...................................................... 388
          9.32321 Links between the study and the findings ......................... 388
          9.32322 Convergence, confirmation and disconfirmation ............... 390
      9.324 External validity/transferability/fittingness ................................. 393
        9.3241 Sampling .......................................................................... 394
        9.3242 Links to prior and emergent theory ...................................... 396
        9.3243 Evidence for generalisability .............................................. 397
    9.33 Utilisation/application/action orientation ....................................... 398
      9.331 Implications for social change ................................................ 398
        9.3311 The potential for change ..................................................... 399
        9.3312 Evidence of change ............................................................ 402
        9.3313 Further action ..................................................................... 403
  9.3 Summary of conclusions, evaluation and implications ........................ 406

References ................................................................................................. 407

Appendices .............................................................................................. 425
  Appendix 1: Diary coding system ......................................................... 425
  Appendix 2: Diary coded text segments ............................................... 427
  Appendix 3: Diary texts ....................................................................... 499
  Appendix 4: Brochure coding system .................................................... 554
  Appendix 5: Brochure coded text segments ......................................... 557
  Appendix 6: Brochure texts ................................................................. 668
  Appendix 7: EA News texts ................................................................. 702
  Appendix 8: ELICOS Accreditation handbook ..................................... 756
  Appendix 9: Introductory letter to colleges ........................................... 800
  Appendix 10: Consent forms (teacher and institutional) ....................... 801
  Appendix 11: Guidelines for participants ............................................. 805
  Appendix 12: Report on ACTA workshop ............................................ 807
FIGURES AND TABLES

FIGURES

Figure 1: Dimensions of discourse ................................................................. 25
Figure 2: Three dimensional conception of discourse (Fairelough, 1992, p. 73) .......... 44
Figure 3: Research map (Layder, 1993, p. 72) .................................................. 54
Figure 4: Outline of the ontology ........................................................................ 58
Figure 5: Components of data analysis: Interactive model
           (Miles & Huberman, 1994, p. 12) ............................................................ 104
Figure 6: Process of analysis .............................................................................. 107
Figure 7: Outline of the study ............................................................................. 122
Figure 8: Relations between teachers, managers and students ......................... 201
Figure 9: Community of consumption .............................................................. 263

TABLES

Table 1: The data sets ...................................................................................... 124
Table 2: The diarists ......................................................................................... 195
Table 3: The role of the teacher ......................................................................... 208
Table 4: Managers’ priorities ............................................................................ 213
Table 5: Students as learners ............................................................................ 215
Table 6: Absent participants ............................................................................ 219
Table 7: Evaluation/appraisal ........................................................................... 225
Table 8: Classroom teaching ............................................................................ 236
Table 9: Professional development .................................................................. 243
Table 10: Beyond the college .......................................................................... 245
Table 11: The colleges ...................................................................................... 251
Table 12: Correlations between the brochure and diary findings ..................... 271
Table 13: Products and attractions as participants ........................................... 278
Table 14: College displaces and possesses/controls ......................................... 289
Table 15: College provides/assures satisfaction ................................................ 294
Table 16: Supporting voices/agents .................................................................. 300
Table 17: Students/readers as beneficiaries ...................................................... 305
Table 18: Students/readers as consumers ......................................................... 309
ABSTRACT

This study focuses on how commercialisation affects professional practices, specifically those of English language teachers. The study takes as its setting the private English language teaching sector in Australia, known as the ELICOS (English Language Intensive Courses for Overseas Students) sector. The research question is 'How does commercialisation affect the professional practices of teachers who work in ELICOS colleges in Australia?'.

To investigate this question, a “multi-perspectived” (Candlin 1997, p. xiv) approach to discourse analysis is developed. This seeks to address the implications of Cicourel's (1982, 1992, 1996) call for “ecological validity” (1982, pp. 1ff) in social and sociolinguistic research. These implications include the need to account for interrelations between language and context, for macro and micro social phenomena, for choices in research methodology, for the position of the researcher within discourse analysis, and, more generally, for the social-situatedness of discourse analysis itself.

The framework integrates theoretical and research traditions from linguistics and sociology within five ‘perspectives’: that of the analyst, the participants, the social resource, the social practice, and the social/institution. To enable their operationalisation in research, these perspectives are integrated with the “interactive” model of data analysis developed by Miles and Huberman (1994, pp. 12ff). This offers a reflexive and iterative model in which the stages of the research process inform each other and are continually refined in response to emergent findings.

The research design employs this framework to investigate the discourses which shape teachers’ ability to maintain their standards of professional practice. In operationalising the analyst’s perspective, my resources as the analyst are explained in relation to those of the participants, to the study itself, and to the social-theoretical account.
of commercialisation developed throughout the study. The other perspectives are operationalised using five data sets. The participants' perspective draws on critical incident diaries kept by ELICOS teachers; the social resource perspective on promotional brochures produced by ELICOS colleges; and the social/institutional perspective draws on published data – the News-letter of the sector’s peak body, regulations of the industry regulatory authority, and teacher training materials. The social practice perspective is not operationalised because this would have exceeded the scope of the current study by including data reflecting examples of teachers’ practices.

As part of this design, the findings of the diary and brochure analyses are compared to seek evidence of interdiscursive relations between them. This comparison yields a pattern of correlations which evidences the operation of the ‘discourse of commercialisation’. As the dominant discourse within the colleges, this, it is argued, advances the construction of managers, teachers and students as a ‘community of consumption’, within which teaching and learning are ‘consumption processes’. Based on the analysis of the social/institutional data, and explained by the social-theoretical account of commercialisation developed through the study, these constructions are, it is argued, themselves advanced by the operations of macro actors and legitimised by “neoliberal discourse” (Bourdieu. 1998a, p. 95).
DECLARATION

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any institution of higher education; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Jonathan Alexander Crichton

June 23, 2003
I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Christopher Candlin, whose knowledge, understanding and encouragement have been critical for the progress and completion of the thesis. Throughout this journey, his scholarship, insight and advice have been invaluable, providing both a comprehensive guide to the field and support for the development of my own ideas. I would also like to thank my external supervisor, Professor Robert Barrett, for his feedback on drafts of the thesis. For data collection, I have many people to thank, but foremost among these are the teachers who participated in the study with such commitment, and the managers who allowed me access to the colleges. For her support in the early stages of the thesis, I am indebted to Ruth Wajnryb, and, for computing support towards the end, I owe thanks to Richard and Jo Cave. Finally, I would like to thank my family, especially my wife, Veruschka, for her uncompromising support at every stage, and our children, Elise and Arthur, for their patience with the demands of the thesis.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACTA</td>
<td>Australian Council of TESOL Associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AEI</td>
<td>Australian Education International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AV-CC</td>
<td>Australian Vice-Chancellors' Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CELTA</td>
<td>Certificate in English Language Teaching to Adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRICOS</td>
<td>Commonwealth Register of Institutions and Courses for Overseas Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTEFLA</td>
<td>Certificate in Teaching English as a Foreign Language to Adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEST</td>
<td>Department of Education, Science and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DETYA</td>
<td>Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIMA</td>
<td>Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA</td>
<td>ELICOS Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELICOS</td>
<td>English Language Intensive Courses for Overseas Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELT</td>
<td>English Language Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESLE</td>
<td>English as a Second Language Educators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESOS Act</td>
<td>Education Services for Overseas Students Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IELTS</td>
<td>International English Language Testing System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Code</td>
<td>National code of practice for registration authorities and providers of education and training to overseas students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEAS</td>
<td>National ELT Accreditation Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TESOL</td>
<td>Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCLES</td>
<td>University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>