Intertextuality, heteroglossia, and systemic functional linguistics: A framework for analysing ideology

John McAndrew
B.Sc. Psychology, M.A. App. Ling.

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Division of linguistics and Psychology, Macquarie University, 28 September, 2001
Contents

List of Figures vii
List of Tables ix

1. Introduction

1.1 The focus of the present study .............................................. 1

1.2 Key notions in the present study ............................................ 5

1.3 Aims ................................................................................. 7

1.4 The ideology framework ....................................................... 7

1.5 Theoretical bases .................................................................. 8

1.6 The construction of discourse formations (DFs) ....................... 13
  1.6.1 The construction of discourse formations (DFs) in the NSWFA text .... 14
  1.6.2 Intertextual discourse formations (IDFs) ............................... 16

1.7 Analysis ........................................................................... 24
  1.7.1 The texts analysed ............................................................ 25
  1.7.2 Six stages of analysis ......................................................... 27
  1.7.3 The systems of meaning-making investigated in the analysis .......... 27
  1.7.4 Competing Discourses and the analysis ................................ 28
  1.7.4.1 The Government’s aims .................................................. 31
  1.7.4.2 Perspectives of CD and TID ........................................... 33

1.8 The original nature of the present study .................................. 35

1.9 Summary ......................................................................... 38

1.9 Thesis layout ...................................................................... 39

2.1 Overview of SFL Theory

2.1.1 Introduction ..................................................................... 41

2.1.2 SFL in relation to logico-philosophical linguistics .................. 42

2.1.3 Language as social semiotic .............................................. 46

2.1.4 The functional nature of language .................................... 51
2.3.5.3 Text semantics ................................................................. 155
2.3.5.4 Text thematic formations and intertextual thematic formations ...... 157

2.3.6 Relating Lemke's theory of intertextuality to the present study ...... 159
  2.3.6.1 Discourse formations and thematic formations .......................... 159
  2.3.6.1.1 Discourses and IDFs .................................................. 164

2.3.7 Heteroglossia and social order ............................................. 164
  2.3.7.1 Compositional and metadiscursive relations between formations .......... 167

2.3.8 Conclusion ............................................................................. 173

3. Methodology: A Framework for analysis

3.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 175

3.2 A skeleton overview of the methodology ........................................ 175

3.3 Theory .......................................................................................... 176

3.4 The choice of data .......................................................................... 176
  3.4.1 Choosing texts for intertextual relevance ...................................... 178
  3.4.1.1 Intertextual bases for selection .............................................. 179
  3.4.1.2 Choosing intertextual texts and the context of situation ......... 181
  3.4.1.3 Positioning data using Martin's 'issues as ideological systems' model ........................................ 182
  3.4.2 Data chosen and positionings on the issues as ideological systems model. 187

3.5 Analysing the texts ........................................................................ 190
  3.5.1 The visual modality ................................................................. 191
  3.5.2 The genre of the text .............................................................. 192
  3.5.3 Clausal semantics ..................................................................... 192
  3.5.4 Clausal semantics in relation to the DFs of the core participants .......... 194
  3.5.5 DFs of the core participants in relation to DFs in CD and TID .......... 195
  3.5.6 Relations between core participants in the NSWFA text in comparison to relations between core participants in CD and TID ................................. 196

3.6 Validity .......................................................................................... 197

4. Analysis: The ideology of the NSWFA text

4.1 Introduction ................................................................................... 198

4.2 The different meaning-making systems analysed ............................. 202
4.3 Considerations of Analysis ................................................................. 220
  4.3.1 The rationale for analysis at the clause level .................................. 220
  4.3.2 Core participants ........................................................................... 220
  4.3.3 The ordering of reading of the text .................................................. 221
  4.3.4 Sub-headings used in the analysis .................................................. 223
  4.3.5 Capitalization .................................................................................. 224
  4.3.6 Key for the lexicogrammatical box diagrams ................................... 225

4.4 Analysis of the visual modality .............................................................. 226
  4.4.1 Composition: The arrangement of text and images ......................... 226
  4.4.2 Interpersonal: A consideration of direct Gaze .................................. 230
  4.4.3 Ideational: Representation of the Actors ......................................... 232

4.5 Genre ................................................................................................. 233
  4.5.1 The narrative genre and the NSWFA text ........................................ 233
  4.5.2 The genre of advertising as a resource .......................................... 235

4.5 The construction of the core participants: The core participants as
DFs in the NSWFA text: Clausal analysis ................................................ 237
  4.6.1 Clause 1: NSW Forest Agreements .................................................. 238
  4.6.2 Clause 2: Something [[2.1 we can all build on]] ................................. 245
  4.6.3 Clause 3: NSW Forest Agreements .................................................. 253
  4.6.4 Clause 4: Helping trees and jobs live together .................................. 256
  4.6.5 Clause 5: The forests belong to everyone ........................................ 262
  4.6.6 Clause 6: We depend on them for the air we breath, for biodiversity .... 268
  4.6.7 Clause 7: And for jobs ................................................................. 273
  4.6.8 Clause 8: NSW Forest Agreements are plans for our forests ............... 279
  4.6.9 Clause 9: based on extensive social, economic and environmental
      research ............................................................................................. 283
  4.6.10 Clause 10. The goals are [[10.1 to improve our environment, our quality
      of life/10.2 and to secure jobs]] ............................................................. 288
  4.6.11 Clause 11: The NSW Government is ensuring the long term acceptance
      of Forest Agreements ....................................................................... 296
  4.6.12 Clause 12: by working with many different parts of the community –
      the timber industry, unions, conservationists, scientists and
      Aboriginal communities .................................................................... 301
  4.6.13 Clause 13: The first NSW Forest Agreement will be centred around
      Eden on the New South Wales south coast ....................................... 309
  4.6.14 Clause 14: Other forests in New South Wales will soon be covered by
      Forest Agreements ........................................................................... 313
  4.6.15 Clause 15: securing this natural resource for us all, now and in the future 318
  4.6.16 Clause 16: Go to www.racac.nsw.gov.au ....................................... 323
  4.6.17 Clause 17: NEW SOUTH WALES GOVERNMENT .......................... 327
4.7 Intertextual and heteroglossic relations: A comparison of constructions in the NSWFA text and those in CD and TID

4.7.1 The construction of CD

4.7.2 The construction of TID

4.7.3 The construction of [FORESTS]: [FORESTS] as TDF

4.7.4 NSWFA text: The construction of [NSWFAs]: [NSWFAs] as TDF

4.7.5 NSWFA text: The construction of [GOVERNMENT]: [GOVERNMENT] as TDF

4.7.6 NSWFA text: The construction of [WE] and [COMMUNITY]: [WE] and [COMMUNITY] as TDFs

4.7.7 NSWFA text: The construction of [JOBS]: [JOBS] as TDF

4.7.8 A Comparison of relations between the DFs of core participants in the NSWFA text in relation to constructions between the DFs in CD and TID

4.7.9 Summary diagrams of the different relations between DFs of core participants in the NSWFA text, CD and TID

4.8 Summary of semantic propositions

4.9 Conclusion of analysis section

5. Discussion/conclusion

5.1 Summary of findings

5.1.1 The process of the NSWFA text

5.1.2 The inter-play between the systems of meaning

5.1.3 Linguistic Drift

5.1.4 Decoding the message of the text

5.2 Criticisms of the analysis

5.2.1 The size of the corpus

5.2.2 The complexity of analysis of texts from CD and TID

5.2.3 Relations between DFs within a text as heteroglossic

5.3 Areas for further study

5.3.1 A coding schedule for relations towards and between DFs

5.3.2 Construction of a theoretical framework for mapping heteroglossic relations and consideration of a level of significance

5.3.3 Mapping thematic formations (TFs) and relating them to maps of discourse formations (DFs)

5.3.4 Bernstein's codes
5.4 Discussion of the social positioning of the NSWFA text in relation to wider social forces ........................................................................................................................................... 420
  5.4.1 The NSWFA text as Government ideology .................................................................................................................................................. 420
  5.4.2 The consequences of the NSWFA text .................................................................................................................................................. 423
  5.4.2 A wider perspective: The NSWFA text and paradigm shifts ..................................................................................................................... 425

5.5 The significance of the present study ................................................................................................................................................................. 430
  5.5.1 Criteria for analysis and the positing of a framework for analysis ......................................................................................................................... 431
  5.5.2 The location of the present study in relation to SFL and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) .................................................................................................. 433
  5.5.2 The present study and multiaccentuality of the sign ........................................................................................................................ 434
  5.5.4 Ideological differences in texts .......................................................................................................................................................... 435

5.6 Conclusion ................................................................................................................................................................................................. 436

Appendices ............................................................................................................................................................................................... 441

References ........................................................................................................................................................................................................ 571
# List of figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Ideology framework</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Construction of a DF</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Construction of [FORESTS] in the NSWFA text</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>A hypothetical example of total potential IDF for [FORESTS]</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Relations between DFs</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Constellation of relationships between DFs of core participants in the NSWFA text</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Relations between DFs in a text and the heteroglossic relations constructed to relations between DFs in significantly framing Discourses</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>Relations between DFs of core participants in the NSWFA text and the heteroglossic relations constructed to relations between DFs in CD and TID</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1</td>
<td>Text as process: actualization of the potential of the system</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2</td>
<td>Paradigmatic and syntagmatic axes</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3</td>
<td>Context of situation as instance of context of culture</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4</td>
<td>Culture, meaning, and situation</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.5</td>
<td>Strata for linguistic description</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.6</td>
<td>The natural and arbitrary relationships of realization in language seen as a semiotic system which interfaces with the material world at both ends</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.7</td>
<td>Metaredundancy</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.8</td>
<td>Realization between the four strata and instance as instantiation of the potential at each stratum</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.9</td>
<td>Context of culture and context of situation along dimension of longterm potentiality</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.10</td>
<td>Lexicogrammatical realizations of register-semantic systems</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.11</td>
<td>Language and its semiotic environment</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.12</td>
<td>Locating the Discourses in terms of potentiality and in relation to language</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1</td>
<td>A theoretical basis for a methodological framework for the analysis of ideology</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2</td>
<td>discourse (small 'd') as instantiation of Discourses</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>A typography of intertextual relations between two texts which allow for their recognition as significant contexts for each other</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>The different word meanings in Lemke's model</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3</td>
<td>Heteroglossic relationships between thematic formations</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Issues as ideological systems</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Issues as ideological systems</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Data chosen in relation to positioning on the framework</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Functional structuring in the visual layout of the text</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Image of the NSWFA text for comparison with the functional structuring shown in figure 4.1</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Generic components of the NSWFA text</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Relations towards [CD]</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Relations towards [CONSERVATIONISTS]</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Relations between [TID] and [CONSERVATIONISTS]</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Relations towards [TID]</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Relations constructed in CD towards [TIMBER INDUSTRY]</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Relations between [TID] and [TIMBER INDUSTRY]</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Relations towards [FORESTS]</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Relations between [TID] and [FORESTS]</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>Relations between [TID] and [FORESTS]</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>Thematic progression in the NSWFA text</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>Relations towards [NSWFAs]</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>Relations towards [NSWFAs]</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>Relations between [TID] and [NSWFAs]</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>Relations towards [GOVERNMENT]</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>Relations between [CD] and [GOVERNMENT]</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of tables

Table 1.1 Abbreviations used in the thesis ................................................................. 4
Table 1.2 Key for figure 1.8......................................................................................... 23
Table 4.1 Ordering of clause analysis in the NSWFA text ......................................... 223
Table 4.2 Abbreviations used in the analysis (reproduced from section 1.1 above) ...... 224
Table 4.3 Abbreviations of lexicogrammatical functions used in the box diagrams ...... 225
Table 4.4 Instances of CD in the NSWFA text ............................................................ 332
Table 4.5 Instances of TID in the NSWFA text .......................................................... 337
Table 4.6 A comparison of semantic propositions relating to [FORESTS] ................. 378
Table 4.7 A comparison of semantic propositions relating to [NSWFAs] ................. 379
Table 4.8 A comparison of semantic propositions relating to [GOVERNMENT] ......... 380
Table 4.9 A comparison of semantic propositions relating to [COMMUNITY] .......... 381
Table 4.10 A comparison of semantic propositions relating to [JOBS]......................... 382
Intertextuality, heteroglossia, and systemic functional linguistics: A framework for analysing ideology

Abstract

This study is concerned with presenting a framework for the analysis of ideology. Ideology is seen as a symbolically articulated phenomenon, understandable through a detailed description of the intertextual and heteroglossic relations that a text enacts in tandem with analysis of the patterns of foregrounding within the text. Through the investigation, this study aims to map significantly relevant elements of the context of culture (Malinowski 1935; Halliday and Hasan 1985) for a particular text. It adopts the systemic functional linguistic model both for lexicogrammatical analysis and for defining the context-text relationship (e.g. Halliday and Hasan 1985; Hasan 1995, 1999; Matthiessen 1993).

In order to exemplify the framework one central text is analysed in the context of its relevant intertexts – the realizations of the meanings put forward by the various social groups which significantly ‘frame’ that text. The central text is an Australian New South Wales Government advertisement for NSW Forest Agreements (hereafter NSWFA text). Corresponding texts, realizing and instantiating intertextually significant Discourses, are positioned for analysis using the ‘issues as ideological systems’ model (Martin 1985, 1986). Lemke’s conception of intertextual semantics (e.g. Lemke 1995a) is used to show how meanings in the NSWFA text construe meanings in two competing Discourses (those of the timber industry and of conservationism). Examination of the meaning-making choices in the lexicogrammar, rhetorical structure, appraisal, visual modality and multimodality is carried out on the NSWFA text in order to realise the consistently foregrounded patterns of meanings (Hasan 1985; Halliday and Hasan 1985). Based on these findings, discourse formations, which can be understood as the lexicogrammatical semantic relations in which a participant is enmeshed together with its intertextually derived meanings, are constructed for the core participants in the NSWFA text. These are then compared with discourse formations in the texts of the surrounding Discourses to reveal the heteroglossic relations that the text enacts. By analysis of the instantiation of meanings made in the surrounding texts – the Discourse voices of social groups in the community - and of the heteroglossic value-orientations constructed towards these social groups, the framework is able to put on display the ideology of the text.
DECLARATION

I certify that this work is the result of my own research and that the work has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other university or institution.

Signed: [signature]

Date: 12/11/02
Acknowledgments

I sincerely thank all those who have supported me in the completion of this thesis. I am particularly grateful to my supervisor, Head of Linguistics at Macquarie University, David Hall, and to Rhondda Fahey and Dr. David Butt.

In many ways my greatest thanks must go to my wife Paula, and children Jade, Sian, and Rosie for their encouragement, understanding and love.